ETHICAL CONUNDRUMS IN JUDGING

Justice C. V. Karthikeyan



Ethical Foundation

- Understanding struggle for freedom.
- ➤ Constitutional Values.
- ➤ Understanding India at 75.

Constitutional Vision of Justice

- Social, economic and political.
- ➤ Justice Jus + Stice = Code of conduct which is constant.
- > Restoring equality.
- ➤ Acknowledgement of suffering.
- > Securing justice.

Bangalore Principles of Judicial Conduct

- ➤ Independence.
- ➤ Impartiality.
- ➤ Integrity.
- ➤ Propriety.
- > Equality.
- ➤ Competence.
- ➤ Diligence.

Ethical Judicial Decision-making

- Capacity to understand a situation.
- ➤ Taking proper action.
- ➤ Learning from mistakes.
- ➤ Intelligent reasoning.
- > Drawing a better conclusion.

BHAGAT RAJA vs UNION OF INDIA & Others

AIR 1967 SC 1606

"It goes without saying that both the High Court and this Court are placed under a great disadvantage if no reasons are given and the revision is dismissed curtly by the use of the single word "rejected", or, "dismissed". In such a case, this Court can probably only exercise its appellate jurisdiction satisfactorily by examining the entire records of the case and after giving a hearing come to its conclusion on the merits of the appeal. This will certainly be a very unsatisfactory method of dealing with the appeal."

Ethical Dilemmas in Judging

- ➤ Independence as the *sine qua non* of judicial ethical integrity.
- ➤ Upholding rule of Law.
- > Decisional independence.
- ➤ Institutional independence.

Decisional Independence

Ability to render a judgment without social prejudice or personal bias.

Institutional Independence

- > Structural autonomy of judiciary.
- External regulation of judicial conduct.

Peripheral Pressures

- General pervasiveness of corruption in society.
- > Social media and its influence.

Core Professional Pressures

- Caste, culture, creed and language.
- ➤ Go safe syndrome.
- > Seeking adulation.

Accountability

- Accountable for decisions contrary to Constitutional or legal standards.
- Sensitivity to promote constitutional vision of justice.
